Diversity policy in employment and service provision

Case study: Tallinn, Estonia
## Contents

- Background 1
- Profile of Tallinn 5
- Approaches to diversity 8
- Employment policy, practice and outcomes 10
- Diversity in service provision 13
- Key challenges and lessons for CLIP 15
- Bibliography 16
- List of persons interviewed 17
Background

Brief history of migration to Estonia

Estonia was originally settled by Finno-Ugric tribes, who have lived in the territory for over 5,000 years. In the 12th–14th centuries it was colonised first by the Danes and later by the Order of Teutonic Knights, which formed a landowning élite also throughout the Swedish occupation (1561–1721) and during the subsequent Russian rule (1721–1918). Despite the numerical prevalence of Estonians, political and economic power was to remain with the Germans and Russians until 1918. Throughout this period, the ethnic composition of the territory remained comparatively stable, with Estonian and German as the main languages of communication.

Estonian nationalism developed only in the late 19th century and eventually led to the establishment of the Republic of Estonia in 1918. The War of Independence lasted until 1920, when the first constitution was adopted. At that time the population was still relatively homogeneous (in 1922 there were 969,976 Estonians, 91,109 Russians, 18,319 Germans, 7,850 Swedes, 4,566 Jews and 14,508 of other nationalities). Following the Tartu Peace Treaty (1920), Estonian citizenship was granted to the whole population.

In the interwar years the government promoted cultural autonomy for national minorities, also to mitigate the consequences of the land reform that had expropriated the former élites. With the Soviet-German non-aggression pact Estonia was first occupied and then incorporated by the USSR in 1940, to become the Estonian Soviet Socialist Republic (SSR). Mass deportations of the local population began. The Soviet period was interrupted by German occupation (1941–1945): Jews were severely persecuted, while most Swedes left in 1943 (following a German–Swedish Treaty) and in 1944 another 70,000 Estonians left the country.

After the war, the re-establishment of Russian rule involved further deportations (50,000 people between 1945 and 1949), which – combined with immigration from Russia – drastically reduced the number of Estonians: in the period 1945–1989 the percentage of non-Estonians grew from 2.7% to 38.5% of the total population. Such an intake was essentially due to the vast labour demand created by post-war industrialisation. The total number of immigrants during the Soviet period (mainly established in the north-east and Tallinn) was 1.4 million, and involved a ‘Russification’ process in many spheres of life – government, administration, economy, education. However, the migration turnover was very high, with around seven out of eight immigrants emigrating at one time or another.

In 1991 independence was declared and Estonian sovereignty re-established. A new constitution came into force in 1992, replacing the old one that had remained in force de jure during the Soviet period. Since then Estonian society has remained ethnically divided, with marginal contacts between immigrants and the Estonian population – given the different workplaces, different cultural habits and the small number of mixed marriages.
Estonia’s population is composed of several nationalities. A total of 1,342,409 people live in Estonia (2007). Those with Estonian nationality make up 68% of the population (or 921,062 people). The largest group with other than Estonian citizenship are Russians: 344,280 people with Russian nationality live in Estonia, which amounts to 26%. Other nationalities make up smaller proportions of Estonian society: 28,158 Ukrainians make up 2%; 1% each have Belorussian or Finnish nationality (16,133 and 11,035). Another 2% (21,741 people) have another nationality.

Of the ethnic minorities living in Estonia (2006), 39% are citizens of Estonia and 20% are citizens of Russia. Only 2% of the ethnic minorities have citizenship other than Estonian or Russian, while a striking 39% are people with an undefined citizenship (Source: Statistics Estonia 2006).

On the employment situation of the people living in Estonia, Figure 2 indicates the distribution of the employed according to the three sectors of the economy. There are some differences between the native and the non-Estonian populations: far more Estonians than migrants work in the primary sector (4.7% compared with 0.8%) and in the tertiary sector (64.1% versus 54.6%). The opposite applies to the secondary sector, where 31.2% of Estonians and 44.7% of non-Estonians work.
National policy context: law and policy on diversity and integration

After the restoration of independence, the Estonian government introduced a normalisation programme to facilitate repatriation and integrate minorities. Immigration was put under control with the Law on Immigration (Eesti Vabariigi immigratsiooniseadus) (1990) and the Law on Aliens (Välismaalaste seadus) (1993).

A major issue in this context has been that of Estonian citizenship. Because this was based on the *ius sanguinis* principle, immigrants had to go through a naturalisation process, which also required a basic knowledge of Estonian.

In 2000, the state programme ‘Integration in Estonian Society 2000–2007’ was adopted by the Government of Estonia. This programme mainly emphasises Estonian language proficiency.

The programme was followed by an action plan for governmental and other institutions for the years 2008–2013 in the field of integration: the ‘Integration Strategy 2008–2013’ (approved in 2008). The strategy defines the term ‘integration’ as follows:

- Friendly and secure coexistence that is based on the mutual acceptance and respect of various social groups
- All Estonia’s residents have an equal interest, wish, and opportunity to contribute to public life regardless of ethnicity or native language
- Integration is a long-term process
- The premise of policy is that more active promotion of participation of minorities in society is needed.
One aim of the strategy is to achieve conditions that make all permanent residents of Estonia, irrespective of their ethnic origin (a) feel secure in Estonia, (b) competent in the state language, (c) share the values underlying the Constitution, and (d) able to lead a fulfilled life by participating in the social, economic and cultural life of the country. Besides, everyone is guaranteed the right to preserve and develop his/her language and culture.

The strategy will be implemented in three areas: educational and cultural integration, social and economic integration and legal and political integration. However, the main focus of both the state programme and the Integration Strategy is on Estonian language proficiency.
Profile of Tallinn

Brief description of the city

Tallinn is the capital of the Republic of Estonia. It is located in the north-east of the country, covering an area of approximately 159 square kilometres. With its 396,852 inhabitants (January 2007), it is Estonia’s biggest city. Since 1991 – the year when the country regained its independence from the former Soviet Union – Tallinn has experienced a steady decline in its population. It decreased from 476,591 people in 1991 to an all-time low of 396,010 in 2005. During the past two years, population figures have begun to grow again.

In 1997, Tallinn’s Old Town was entered on UNESCO’s World Heritage List, acknowledging its long-standing history and notable architecture. Tourism is an important branch of industry for the city. Besides, Tallinn has a long history of trade and businesses. Its harbour is the third largest in the Baltic Sea and thanks to its location and proximity to Scandinavia and Russia, Tallinn attracts foreign investment.

The economic situation of Tallinn – as well as the whole country – had alternated during the past 10 years. Looking at the unemployment rate of the city, an increase up to the year 2001 (from 8.5% in 1997 to 12.5% in 2001) is noticeable. Since then, unemployment in the city has declined to 3.4% in 2007. Compared with Estonia as a whole, Tallinn has a slightly lower unemployment rate.

The city’s migrant population

For most of their history, Estonians – including the residents of Tallinn – have lived under the rule of foreign powers. With the support of foreign powers, German nobility as well as Russian administrators and workers came to live in Estonia. Until the middle of the 20th century, Estonia could be considered to be almost entirely one nationality, although not from an ethnocultural standpoint, for the population included Germans, Swedes, Jews, Russians and others. According to the 1934 census, 133,893 people of foreign nationality lived in Estonia – that means 12% of the population did not have Estonian citizenship.

Mass immigration began in the 1940s after the occupation of Estonia by the Soviet Union. After the Second World War it developed into a directed, imperialist nationality programme, when migrants arrived in Estonia as the result of the organised resettlement of large groups as well as through individual immigration. After the occupation of Estonia the Soviet objective was to replace the Estonian language and culture with the Russian language and international socialist culture. Migrants, above all Russians, played a significant roll in the socio-economic structure during the Soviet period. They were employed en masse in large-scale industrial enterprises which – typically at that time – often had a military orientation.

Immigrants to Estonia came from across the entire territory of the Soviet Union. Taking demographic features into account, they had a major impact on the composition of Estonia’s population. Since an overwhelming number of the migrants were young, the natural increase in their numbers was larger than that of the native population. This brought about a continuous decline in the Estonian share of the population. The migrants primarily congregated in Tallinn and north-east Estonia, where they soon became the dominant group.

Almost half (47.4%) of Tallinn’s population (2007) are Estonians. The second major group are the Russians with 34.8%. Ukrainian nationality accounts for 3.5%, and Byelorussian 1.9%. Other nationalities amount to 2.9%. For 9.4%, nationality is not indicated or not known.
Of the Estonians living in Tallinn 99% were born in Estonia, while only 58% of the ethnic minorities living in Tallinn were born in the country (Estonian Open Society Institute, social survey 2007).

As regards the age structure of Tallinn’s population, only two age groups have a higher share of Estonians than non-Estonians: while more than 10% of Estonians are between 15 and 19 years of age, the figure for non-Estonians is only about 6%. The difference between the two groups is even higher in the oldest age group examined. More than 30% of Estonians are between 60 and 74 years old; less than 15% of the migrants fall into this category. Within the age group 30 to 39, the percentages of Estonians and minorities are equal. The other three classes show a higher percentage for the minorities. The biggest difference can be spotted in the age group 40 to 49; slightly more than 10% of Estonians and about 26% of non-Estonians fall into that category.
The unemployment rate of Estonians living in Tallinn is 2%, for minorities it is 7% (Statistics Estonia 2006).

**The city authorities**

The city of Tallinn is governed by the City Council (*Linnavolikogu*) and the City Government (*Linnavalitsus*).

The City Council is the representative body of Tallinn and is elected directly by the citizens. As an independent unit, it decides on the competences of the local government. Currently, the City Council has 63 members (as of August 2007): the majority are from the Centre Party Faction (32 members), 15 are from the Reform Party Faction, nine members of the city council belong to the Pro Patria Faction, another four to the Estonian Social Democratic Party and three members are independent.

Affiliated to the City Council are a City Council Office, eleven committees (e.g. education and culture, health and social care, environment) and separate City District Councils. The latter are administrative agencies within the eight districts Haabersti, Centre, Krisiine, Lasnamäe, Mustamäe, Nõmme, Põhja-Tallinn and Northern Tallinn. Their statutes, structure, personnel and salary levels get proposed by the City Government and have to be approved by the City Council.

The City Government is the executive body and is composed of the mayor and six deputy mayors. Each of the deputy mayors is responsible up to three of the twelve municipal departments, which are: cultural heritage, sports and youth, education, social and health care, housing, land issues, city enterprises, environment, public engineering services, transport, city planning and the municipal police.

Associated with the City Government is the City Office, which is responsible for another two municipal departments (city archives and vital statistics) as well as for administrative tasks. The office’s 181 employees mainly work in areas like PR, IT, financial or human resources services.
**Historical background**

The entry of migrants after the occupation of Estonia in 1940 did not require their adaptation or integration into Estonian conditions. On the contrary, learning the Estonian language and culture were considered unimportant. To the migrants, living in Estonia was the same as living in any other region of the Soviet Union, because life was organised in the Russian language, and institutions operated in Russian. The restoration of Estonian independence in 1991 caught the migrants off guard, bringing a sudden change in their status – the dominant population of the empire had become a minority. Settling down to live in Estonia after the war, the migrants didn’t consider themselves to be immigrants here or a minority, but instead citizens of the Soviet Union, since the Soviet Union had occupied Estonia.

It is only since the restoration of Estonian independence that they have become used to the idea of having to live as minorities in Estonia. The Aliens Act and Language Act, both adopted in the early years of the restoration of Estonian independence, and the provisions contained within it, meant social shock for the majority of immigrants to Estonia; those migrants who had been living permanently in Estonia were not automatically awarded citizenship. Tough Estonian language requirements were enforced and, in addition, a citizenship examination had to be completed. The standard assumption of a national minority is that it is an ethnic group, whose historical homeland has forcibly been joined with another state. In Estonia the situation is just the opposite, since Estonia was forcibly annexed by the Soviet Union. Immigrants have lived in Estonia for a long time as what would be called standard immigrants in other Western countries. For the majority of the immigrants Estonia is their home, which they do not wish to leave, and it is more than just a place to work temporarily, which is typical for a working immigrant.

The percentage of new immigrants (who arrived in Tallinn after 1991) in comparison with other European capitals is very low, remaining below 1%.

Attempts have been made to integrate minorities into Estonian society on the basis of the state integration proposal which began in 2000. The Estonian rooted integration model presumes, on the one hand, that minorities will learn the Estonian language and will take part equally with Estonians in local cultural and political life. On the other hand, integration presumes that the minorities will preserve their cultural uniqueness and language.

The city of Tallinn lacks its own diversity policy. Until recently hope was placed in the state integration programme, which has not delivered the desired results. On the basis of the research conducted in 2007, three-quarters of the residents of Tallinn consider the integration that has taken place so far to be unsuccessful (Estonian Open Society Institute study, 2007). Minorities feel that they are excluded and secondary. Therefore, a minority policy for Tallinn is being developed for the period 2008–2013.

**Objectives of the policy approach**

The minority policy objective is to ensure the minority population’s equal position with the primary population: the same rights and opportunities to influence and develop what is taking place in Tallinn. The policy includes all minorities living in Tallinn.

The city's diversity policy supports the state integration programme and shares common goals. There are no restrictions on gathering data concerning race, religion or faith in Estonia.
Diversity policy in employment and service provision

Responsibility: elected representatives and officials

Responsible for the diversity policy in Tallinn – which is currently being developed – are the City Office as well as one of the deputy mayors.

As described above, the City Office is affiliated to the City Government. It is led by the City Secretary who gets appointed by the Mayor of Tallinn. The office generally performs administrative tasks and will thus be rather concerned with the coordination of the city’s diversity policy.

The unit mainly in charge with developing an overall diversity strategy will be the office of the deputy mayor responsible for the departments cultural heritage, sports and youth as well as education. This post is currently held by Kaia Jäppinen. In collaboration with the integration advisor, members of the City Council, municipal employees, representatives of NGOs as well as scientific experts, diversity measures will be compiled.

Collaboration with social partners and NGOs

The city of Tallinn cooperates closely with all the larger national minority organisations. In Tallinn, a Consultative Council (created in 2003) has been formed alongside the city government, whose representatives are members of the largest minority organisations. Minority organisation representatives participate directly in the development of diversity policy. Future diversity policy will evolve in close cooperation with the NGOs, encompassing both consultations as well as more in-depth collaboration.

Collaboration with social partners on diversity policy is currently under development.

Policy and practice on monitoring progress

Since 2002, Tallinn has ordered public opinion surveys from polling companies on the views and satisfaction of residents. This involves sociological quantitative research, where typical satisfaction scales are used. The views and assessments of all city residents, including ethnic groups, are researched.

Key challenges faced in implementation and broad lessons learnt

The diversity policy of Tallinn and its implementation principles are currently under development. The progress and ideas of the development of diversity policy are reflected in Tallinn forums, where they have offered great interest, above all, to the Russian language media. The attitude of the Russian language media has been positive, while the attitude of the Estonian media has been indifferent and at times negative. Media reaction to diversity policy before the completion of the programme and publication is difficult to predict.

The city departments of Tallinn are cooperative, although they share different views on the implementation of the policy. The challenges the city will face in implementing its diversity policy have still to be seen.

Potential future policy development

Tallinn’s future diversity policy is focused on reinforcing the position and role of ethnic minorities in the active development of the city. As stated above, this policy is currently under development.
Employment policy, practice and outcomes

Profile of city employees

The city of Tallinn employs a total of 13,304 people. They work in the public sector, e.g. at schools, administration and hospitals, and 1,500 of them are directly employed in the municipal administration.

In Estonia, employers cannot ask about data on migration background or ethnicity. Hence, no official data are available that could show in which occupations and at what levels of seniority and skills the city employs people with a migration background.

According to experts interviewed, the city administration employs a large number of Russian-speaking people, many of whom are native speakers, i.e. people of Russian ethnicity. However, official statistics do not exist.

Employment diversity policy

The city of Tallinn employs its staff according to qualification and competence, aiming at neither favouring nor discriminating against any groups in its recruitment procedures. The decision to offer employment for both employees and civil servants has to be made regardless of their sex, faith or ethnic origin. Only the degree, expertise and experience a (prospective) employee possesses are important. These principles apply equally to all individuals and groups; the municipal employment policy is the same for every employee, irrespective of nationality or ethnicity.

This approach implies that the overall personnel policy does not use either positive actions, quotas or target figures to boost the number of people with a migration or minority background within the administration, or conduct measures to improve the employment or career situation of employees with a migration or minority background. A diversity approach in employment policy has not been elaborated. It is seen as an asset, however, not only to have Estonian language skills, but also Russian ones.

Challenges and tensions in development and implementation of policy

In the course of the development of a municipal integration concept, there have also been discussions on the implementation of a diversity approach. In both the City Council and the municipal administration there seems to be a consensus that diversity in employment and the provision of services is reasonable. So a future development and implementation of such policies should not cause any tensions in the city administration. However, this still has to be tested.

Recruitment, training and promotion

As stated above, the decision to offer employment has to be made based on experience, qualifications and performance on the job, irrespective of gender, origin, beliefs, etc. Non-discrimination in recruitment and promotion procedures has a high priority for recruiting and managing staff. The same is true concerning staff training and career development: the short-term goals of municipal personnel policy include training administrative staff – the training provisions are the same for every employee.

The city does not target people with a migration or ethnic background for particular posts in its recruitment or promotion procedures and does not use any positive actions or quota. Neither does the city conduct specific measures to improve the professional career of employees with a migration or minority background.
Equal pay and working conditions

According to Estonian law, an employee’s salary and working conditions do not depend on the ethnicity or a migration background, but on the position and activity performed within the municipality. Hence, equal pay and working conditions for equal work are principally guaranteed for all employees. However, there are no measures or policies for positive action in place. In addition, within the course of this study, it has been impossible to judge whether the pay scale classification is always implemented in a non-discriminatory manner.

Harassment, discrimination and complaints

Thanks to the above-mentioned policy of equal opportunities, the City Government has employed Russian deputy mayors and Russian-speaking employees have occupied relevant positions in various areas of the city administration. However, according to the experts interviewed, discrimination and harassment do take place, and for people with migration or ethnic minority background it is harder to make a career in some occupations.

This expert opinion is not based on solid figures. There are no statistical data and there has not been any complaint of ethnic discrimination in recent years. This may be thanks to the policy and atmosphere of equal opportunities. It may also be due to the absence of a culture of ‘fishing for complaints’: how someone could or should react after being subjected to harassment or discrimination, or after having noticed discrimination against somebody else, has not been institutionalised by the city. If an employee is subject to harassment or discrimination, this employee may entrust the complaint to their boss, to the Personnel Office, or to the NGO Legal Information Centre for Human Rights that is in close contact with the municipality. These bodies should pay attention to this complaint in the form of counselling, support, documentation or recommendations for countermeasures or consequences. Consequently, the city can take measures such as instruction, admonition, or legal or disciplinary proceedings. This ‘procedure’ (as it may be called) is the same for every employee, irrespective of a possible migration or minority background or a racist motivation for the harassment or discrimination.

The city of Tallinn is aware of the challenges relating to discrimination and wishes to increase the tolerance of municipal employees. To reach this goal, the city plans educational training sessions for employees, in particular for educational and social workers as well as for administrative employees having direct contact with citizens.

Besides, social surveys on discrimination are scheduled for 2008 and the implementation of a monitoring system covering discrimination due to ethnicity is planned. This monitoring system will be accompanied by information material and supervision.

Accommodation of cultural and religious needs

The city makes no general arrangements to accommodate particular cultural or religious requirements of its employees. Since this is not an issue for the employees, the city is not planning to introduce such arrangements. In the few cases arising, the city makes individual arrangements within its capabilities.

Health and safety

The city is aware that employees have to be informed adequately about health and safety conditions in the workplace. Since all employees are required to have at least mid-level Estonian language proficiency, there are no employees with serious language problems. Hence, the city does not take any steps to ensure this information is communicated in a systematic, institutionalised manner. If an employee, however, has language problems, practical briefing is done on site.
Induction and language tuition

The city does not offer any programme of training, information, advice, or language tuition targeting employees who have newly arrived in the country. In Estonia, such services are provided by private companies and NGOs.

Recognition of qualifications

The municipality of Tallinn welcomes job applicants with qualification obtained abroad. If necessary for the job performed, the qualification has to be officially recognised. In Estonia, the process of accreditation of qualification is not arranged at the city level, but has to be done by a national institution.

Monitoring

The appointment, employment and careers of people with a migration or minority background are not monitored. Since in Estonia, employers are not allowed to ask about ethnicity or cultural background, the city is not planning to introduce such monitoring.

Impact of policy and lessons learnt

To date, the municipal personnel policy is the same for every employee, irrespective of nationality or ethnicity. The city pursues an equal opportunities approach, but no diversity approach in relation to personnel policy that could have an impact on the employment of people with a migration or minority background.
Diversity in service provision

Services provided and contracted out

The municipal service provision is the same for every resident of the city of Tallinn, irrespective of nationality, ethnicity or migration background. The most important social welfare services are (1) lodging and shelter services, (2) rehabilitation and resocialisation services for the least privileged, (3) counselling and rehabilitation services for addicts and people who are HIV-positive, (4) diagnostics and health services, and (5) support for people with difficulties in coping (Social Welfare and Health Care Department: 2007).

A variety of social and particularly cultural services are also provided by minority organisations, such as the International Association of National Cultural Societies Lüüra, Estonian Peoples Union, Fenno-Ugria Foundation, Slavic Educational Society, Slavic Culture Society. Most of them are funded by the city of Tallinn (Source: Cultural Heritage Department: 2007).

Diversity policy in and access to services

The great majority of non-Estonians in Tallinn are Russians. These people have, in general, the same needs as native people have. Hence, it is not necessary to offer Russian specific programmes or to conduct special measures. Nonetheless, they have to tackle a specific challenge: their literacy in the official language, Estonian, is often insufficient to communicate adequately in Estonian.

To facilitate the access to municipal services for residents with Russian ethnicity, the city of Tallinn provides an outstanding service: every official publication and every service is not only offered in Estonian, but also in Russian.

Employment profile of service providers

As mentioned above, employers in Estonia cannot ask about data on migration background or ethnicity. Hence, no official data are available that could show in which occupations and at what levels of seniority and skills the city employs people with a migration background. The same is true for external service providers.

Monitoring of access and outcomes identified

The city of Tallinn conducts social surveys to monitor the access of Tallinn’s residents to distinctive municipal services. The city, however, has neither differentiated between ethnicities nor asked about a migration background.

Cultural awareness of staff

According to officials interviewed, most, if not all, employees of the municipality are aware of cultural differences of distinctive ethnic groups. Nonetheless, the city of Tallinn wants to improve the intercultural competence of service providers and sensitise them to the specific needs of certain groups. The future integration and diversity policy will probably include the provision of training programmes regarding intercultural competence. Until now, such training has been done by distinctive establishments like hospitals, kindergartens and the police.
Discrimination against service users

Estonian law forbids discrimination on grounds of ethnicity by municipal service providers. A person who nonetheless feels discriminated against has the opportunity to complain on the municipal hotline as well as at the NGO Legal Information Centre for Human Rights which is in direct contact with the municipality.

Impact of policy on access to and quality of services

Since every official publication and every service is not only offered in Estonian, but also in Russian, the city can be sure that the large Russian ‘minority’ (that makes up nearly half the capital’s population) has the same access to municipal services as the native Estonian population.
Key challenges and lessons for CLIP

Mass immigration began in the 1940s after the occupation of Estonia by the Soviet Union: immigrants came from across the entire territory of the Soviet Union. The immigrants, in particular the Russians, played a significant role in the socio-economic structure as well as in cultural and social life. This immigration, together with their natural population growth which was larger than that of the native population, resulted in a continuous decline in the share of Estonians among the population.

Today, Tallinn’s population composition differs significantly from that of Western European cities: Estonians make up 47% of the city’s population; 35% have Russian nationality; and 9%, do not have an official nationality – most of them with Russian background as well. Together with people from Byelorussia, the Russian-speaking residents make up about half of the population. By contrast, immigration from countries other than those of the former Soviet Union is still marginal.

The entry of migrants did not require their adaptation or integration into Estonian conditions. On the contrary, learning the Estonian language and culture were considered unimportant. To the migrants, living in Estonia was the same as living in any other region of the Soviet Union.

This ‘Russification process’ stopped with the restoration of Estonian independence in 1991. Since then Estonian society has remained ethnically divided, with few contacts between immigrants and the Estonian population – given the different workplaces, different cultural habits and the small number of mixed marriages.

Only in the 1990s did the question of the integration of residents with Russian ethnicity into Estonian society arise. In 2000, the state programme ‘Integration into Estonian Society 2000–2007’ was adopted; that was followed by the ‘Integration Strategy 2008–2013’. Both the state programme and the Integration Strategy emphasise Estonian language proficiency for ‘Russians’.

In the end of 2007, the city of Tallinn started to develop its own municipal integration policy. This policy was intended to ensure equal opportunities for the minority population. It is still under development. A diversity approach in personnel policy has not been implemented yet. In service provision, by contrast, one should highlight a special service: to facilitate the access to municipal services by residents with Russian ethnicity, the city of Tallinn provides every official publication and every service not only in Estonian, but also in Russian.
Bibliography


List of persons interviewed

Asari, Eva-Maria; Office of the Minister for Population and Ethnic Affairs, Counsellor to the Minister

Jäppinen, Kaia; Tallinn City Government, Deputy Mayor

Kuldjärv, Maarja; Ministry of Social Affairs, Labour market department

Lepikult, Marika; Tallinn City Government, Director of Personnel

Mätlik, Tanel; Integration Foundation, Director

Pettai, Iris; Open Society Institute, Sociologist, head researcher of integration policy of Tallinn

Poleshchuk, Vadim; NGO Legal Information Centre for Human Rights, Legal advisor, analyst

Semjonov, Aleksei; NGO Legal Information Centre for Human Rights, Director; leader of the municipal integration group on equality

Taliga, Harri; Estonian Trade Union Confederation, President

Trofimov, Ervin; Tallinn City Government, Advisor on integration and related issues

Wolfgang Bosswick and Doris Lüken-Klaßen, efms University of Bamberg